



Some Elaborations on Multiculturalism and *Kyosei* Towards Nuanced Critique

1

Takeo Suzuki (鈴木赳生)

2nd year at the PhD Course of Sociology
at the Graduate School of Letters,
Kyoto University

Introduction

➤ My research

Study of the **conceptual histories** of multiculturalism and *kyosei* *



Response to the workshop provocation

* Works

鈴木赳生, 2017, “マルチカルチュラリズム再考: 包括的な社会理論的把握のために (Rethinking Multiculturalism: Towards Comprehensive Understanding from a Social Theoretical Point of View),” 『京都社会学年報 (Kyoto Journal of Sociology)』, (25): 35-56.

Takeo Suzuki, “Multicultural Question Encounters Liberal Multiculturalism,” Conference of the Association for Cultural Studies, Shanghai: Shanghai University, August 11 2018 (Accepted)

Multiculturalism and *Kyosei* (conviviality)

...Both kyosei in Japan and multiculturalism in Canada are under contestation: while these concepts aim for a society that respects differences, they are also used for national projects that fit the demand of a (neo)liberal market economy. (provocation, para. 4)

- ▶ Though both concepts look similar at the present moment, they are significantly different from a historical point of view.

1. Multiculturalism as governmental ideology (=liberal multiculturalism)

...Liberal multiculturalism... ① does not question the boundary or the constitution of the very spheres in which different collectivities seek equal representation and recognition. Liberal multiculturalism, like its foundational ideal of cultural relativism, ② presumes autonomy, discrete boundaries, and the internal consistency of a cultural group. (Yoneyama 1999: 77, emphasis added)

1. Multiculturalism as governmental ideology (=liberal multiculturalism)

➤ Critique on liberal multiculturalism

...anthropologists have critiqued multicultural approaches for potentially ①essentializing culture; ②masking assimilationist policies, as well as ③economic and institutional inequalities; and ironically being complicit with ④maintaining the project of (settler) colonialism. (para. 3, emphasis added)

① ← ② cultural essentialism

②③④ ← ① preservation of the existing social order

2. Multiculturalism as the social imagination

...By multiculturalism, I refer to the state of a society or the world containing many cultures that interact in some significant way with each other. (Gutmann 1993: 171, emphasis added)

- Multiculturalistic imagination of the social world appeared and disappeared in the modernity (Oguma 2002). The late-modern multiculturalistic imagination emerged from significant change in the mono-cultural imagination of society, caused by various movements by marginalized people in the 1960s-70s.

3. Multiculturalism as social movement?

...multiculturalism was first introduced by left-liberal or social-democratic political parties, in response to popular mobilization by non-dominant groups. It was, in short, 'social movement multiculturalism'. (Kymlicka 2007: 129, emphasis added)



Social movements (identity politics) in the 1960s-70s were not merely about (essentialized) 'culture'. They were about social justice and continuous recreation of identity. (Butler 1997, Collins 2015, Tully 2003)

Conclusion 1

: Pluralism is not necessarily cultural

- Multiculturalism as one form of pluralism

Pluralism arising from various social movements



reformulated into

Multiculturalism

[Cultural pluralism as the definition of situation

[Cultural pluralism as governmental ideology (=liberal multiculturalism)

Kyosei as governmental ideology

- “Symbolic Space for Ethnic Harmony (民族共生象徵空間)”
- ...*The Symbolic Space for Ethnic Harmony, as a national center for revitalizing Ainu culture, is to be developed around Lake Poroto in Shiraoi, Hokkaido prefecture, Japan. The national government, together with Ainu people and others, is now considering specific functions and facilities of the Space.* (https://www.kantei.go.jp/jp/singi/ainusuishin/index_e.html, Retrieved May 3 2018)



Lake Poroto & replicated traditional Ainu houses. © Ainu Museum of Shiraoi.
(https://www.kantei.go.jp/jp/singi/ainusuishin/symbolic_space.html, Retrieved May 2 2018)

Kyosei as governmental ideology

■ Behind the project:

- 2020 Tokyo Olympics and Paralympics

...(the committee of the government) has decided to make the space publicly open in accordance with the 2020 Tokyo Olympic and Paralympic games. (Council for Ainu Policy Promotion 2016: 3, my translation and emphasis)

- Problem of historical injustice relating to stolen skulls and remains of Ainu ancestors (アイヌ遺骨返還訴訟)



(<http://hmjk.world.coocan.jp/index.html>, Retrieved May 2 2018)

Kyosei in social movements

- Ecological movements: response to the crisis of public pollution
 - human-nonhuman relationships
 - critique on capitalism and developmentalism

- *Zainichi* Korean movements: counter to discrimination
 - employment discrimination by *Hitachi* in 1970 (日立就職差別事件)

...difficult solidarity between *Zainichi* Koreans and Japanese activists within a historical context of colonialism (Itoh 2017)



reformulated into

Governmental idea of *Tabunka Kyosei* (Che and Kato 2008)

Conclusion 2

: *Kyosei* as unavoidable negotiation

- Important connotations of *kyosei* in social movement
 - plurality + relationality
 - **necessary negotiation in inevitable togetherness**



- **Conviviality of the porcupines (ハリネズミの共生)**

...Determined to keep from freezing by huddling together in winter...They[porcupines] had to be close enough to keep warm, but distant enough to avoid the pain of the quills...In such contexts of manifest incompleteness, meaning and belonging or conviviality are negotiated on the basis of a fine line of tolerance and respect, catalysed or imposed by necessity. (Nyamnjoh 2017: 13, emphasis added)

References

- Butler, Judith, 1997, "Merely Cultural," *Social Text*, 15: 265–77.
- Collins, Patricia Hill, 2015, "Intersectionality's Definitional Dilemmas," *Annual Review of Sociology*, 41: 1–20.
- Che, Sung and Chikako Kato eds., 2008, *What is Tabunka Kyosei in Japan? : From the Experiences of Zainichi* (Nihon ni okeru Tabunka Kyosei toha Nanika: Zainichi no Keiken kara), Shin Yo Sha.
- Council for Ainu Policy Promotion, 2016, "The Basic Idea of the 'Symbolic Space for Ethnic Harmony' ('Minzoku Kyosei Shocho Kukan' Kihon Koso)" (<https://www.kantei.go.jp/jp/singi/ainusuishin/pdf/kousou20160726.pdf>, Retrieved May 3 2018)
- Gutmann, Amy, 1993, "The Challenge of Multiculturalism in Political Ethics," *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, 22(3): 171–206.
- Itoh, Shiho, 2017, "Sociological Reflection on the Possibilities of 'Solidarity' between Japanese and Zainichi Koreans (Nihonjin to Zainichi Chosenjin no 'Rentai' no Kanosei ni kansuru Shakaigaku teki Kosatsu)," Master's Thesis Submitted to the Graduate of Letters at Kyoto University.
- Kymlicka, Will, 2007, *Multicultural Odysseys: Navigating the New International Politics of Diversity*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Nyamnjoh, Francis B., 2017, "Incompleteness: Frontier Africa and the Currency of Conviviality," *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 52(3): 1–18.
- Oguma, Eiji, trans. David Askew, 2002, *A Genealogy of 'Japanese' Self-Images*, Melbourne: Trans Pacific Press.
- Tully, James, 2003, "Identity Politics," T. Ball & R. Bellamy eds., *The Cambridge History of Twentieth-Century Political Thought*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 517–33.
- Yoneyama, Lisa, 1999, "Habits of Knowing Cultural Differences: *Chrysanthemum and the Sword* in the U.S. Liberal Multiculturalism," *Topoi*, 18: 71–80.