ICTL 2023 Mainz

Day 2 (Thursday, 3 August 2023), Section B6 (P12) 17:00-17:30

Does the modal Uzbek sentence with o'xsha- include a subordinate clause?

HIDAKA Shinsuke

(JSPS/Niigata University)

0. Introduction

Kononov (1960: 420) pointed out the usage in which the structure of the predicate with the dative case -ga followed by o'xsha- 'be like,' expresses the modality meaning 'seems (to do),' and named this usage "a special variation of the complex sentence." However, there was no specific reference to the reason for this naming. Furthermore, the predicate with the dative case -ga in the examples cited in Kononov (1960: 420) may not be used as a predicate in subordinate clauses. In this study, I will compare the modal Uzbek sentence with o'xsha-, based on the examples extracted from the corpus, to ekan 'seem to.' Through this comparison, I will discuss whether the modal Uzbek sentence with o'xsha- includes a subordinate clause.

1. Previous research

1.1. Meaning and usage except the modal usage

Nakajima (2015: 283) revealed four meanings of o'xsha-: 1. [+dative] be similar to, 2. turn out well, 3. compare, 4. [+dative] seem to do. In modern Uyghur, oxsha- has a similar meaning (Sugahara 2009: 268). In Radloff's dictionary (1893: 1002), okua means 'be like, be the same.'

An example of a sentence without a subordinate clause is shown in (1). Here, *o'xsha*- expresses the first meaning revealed by Nakajima (2015: 283).

(1) U ota-si-ga oʻxsha-y=di.

3SG father-3.POSS-DAT be.like-NPST=3

'He is similar to his father' (Nakaiima 2015: 283)

The similarity between the nominative pronoun U 'he' and the dative NP ota-si-ga 'to his father' is expressed by o'xsha- 'be like' in the above sentence.

An example of a sentence with a subordinate clause is (2). This o 'xsha- expresses Nakajima's fourth meaning (2015: 283). I have added [] to clauses regarded as subordinate clauses.

(2) Bu xuddi [turnik-ka birinchi kun-dan 12 marta tort-il-ish]-ga oʻxsha-y=di.
this exactly horizontal.bar-DAT first day-ABL time pull-PASS-VN-DAT be.like-NPST=3
'This exactly seems to do 12 pull-ups on the bars from day one.' (abituriyent.uz)

The similarity between the nominative pronoun *Bu* and the clause [turnik-ka birinchi kun-dan 12 marta tort-il-ish] is expressed by o'xsha-'be like' in the above sentence.

1.2. The modal usage

Kononov (1960: 420) named the modal usage of o 'xsha- 'be like,' "a special variation of the complex sentence (Особая разновидность сложноподчиненного предложения)." I considered that Kononov referred to the case whereby the predicate in the subordinate clause added to the dative $-ga^1$ is followed by, but this o 'xsha- does not

tün-dö uuru kir-gen okšo-y-t. night-loc thief enter-PTCP.PAST be.like

have the lexical meaning 'be like.' However, Kononov did not refer to the reason for this name. In addition, Kononov (1960: 420) stated that o'xsha- becomes the modal word (модальное слово; the item expressing a speaker's attitude) in modal usage.

I cite all examples by Kononov (1960: 420-421). The participle nominalizes the whole clause in (3) and (4), while I considered examples (5) and (6) in which the subordinate clause seems to be formed by adding the dative - ga to bor or vo'a.

- (3) [Bu bechora-ni bir yer-da koʻr-gan]-ga oʻxsha-y=man", de-di-@=da ...
 this pity-ACC one place-LOC see-PTCP.PAST-DAT be.like-NPST=1SG say-PAST-3=EMPH
 "I seem to have seen this pity person here" he said.' (Kononov 1960: 421)
- (4) [Siz bilan hech murosa-ga kel-ol-ma-ydigan]-ga oʻxsha-y=miz.

 2PL with no agreement-DAT come-POT-NEG-PTCP.NPST-DAT be.like-NPST=1PL

 'We never seem to agree with you.' (Kononov 1960: 421)
- (5) [Mening o'z-im-da un-ga nisbatan bir his bor]-ga o'xsha-y=di.

 1SG own-1SG.POSS-LOC 3SG-DAT concerning one feeling existence-DAT be.like-NPST=3

 'I seem to have a certain thought about you.' (Kononov 1960: 420)
- (6) [Bu yer-da hech kim yo'q]-qa o'xsha-y=di. this place-LOC not.at.all who no-DAT be.like-NPST=3 'There seems to be no one here.' (Kononov 1960: 420)

I temporarily regard the predicate added to the dative -ga as the predicate of a subordinate clause, and the dative -ga is added to a subordinate clause until I draw a conclusion regarding the predicates placed before o'xsha- have two aspects (including or not including a subordinate clause).

Judging from the above examples, modal usage refers to evidential or epistemic modalities. I will discuss the meaning of modal usage in the discussion and conclusion sections.

Finally, I will highlight the subjects of o'xsha-. In primary usage, the lexical meaning of o'xsha- can be read, and the subjects of the main and subordinate clauses are different. For example, Bu 'this' is a subject of the main clause in (2), although this subject is not one of the subordinate clauses [turnik-ka birinchi kun-dan 12 marta tort-il-ish] 'to do 12 pull-ups on the bars from day one.' However, there was only one subject in modal usage. In (4), Biz 'we' is a subject by the personal clitic =miz added to a predicate o'xsha-y=miz [be.like-NPST=1PL] of a main clause. This subject is the same as the main clause's predicate, kel-ol-ma-ydigan [come-POT-NEG-PTCP.NPST].

2. Problems

As mentioned, Kononov (1960: 420) named the modal usage of *o'xsha*- 'be like,' "a special variation of the complex sentence." However, Kononov did not refer to the reason for having this phrase. In the first place, *bor* 'existent' in (5) and *yo'q* 'no' in (6) do not function as subordinate predicates without any suffixes. Example a. in (7) includes *bor* 'existent.' The native speaker did not permit example b., in which a. is embedded, and suggested example c. Example c. is one in which a. is embedded by adding *-lik* to *bor*.

2

¹ okšo- 'be like' in Kyrgyz is also used in the modal usage. This is a cognate with o'xsha- in Uzbek. However, a predicate before okšo- does not need the dative marker like Uzbek. In the following example, the predicate kir-gen before okšo-, does not include the dative marker.

^{&#}x27;In night, a thief seemed to enter (to my house).' (Akmatalieva 2022: 128)

- (7) a. Uka-m bor.
 younger.brother-1SG.POSS existence
 'I have a younger brother.'
 - b. *Sanjar [uka-m bor]-ni bil-a=di.

 PN younger.brother-1SG.POSS existence-ACC know-NPST=3

 [Intended reading: Sanjar knows that I have a younger brother.]
 - c. Sanjar [uka-m bor-lig-i]-ni bil-a=di

 PN younger.brother-1sG.POSS existence-CNMLZ-3.POSS-ACC know-NPST=3

 'Sanjar knows that I have a younger brother.'

In this study, I analyzed the clause added to the dative -ga in the modal usage of o 'xsha- from the corpus. I will discuss whether an example in the modal usage of o 'xsha- includes a subordinate clause based on my own analysis.

3. Analysis

I used the "Turkic Web—Uzbek" corpus in the Sketch Engine. This corpus contains 18,720,334 words derived from websites whose URLs include the domain .uz.

Table 1: All items added the dative -ga

		Tokens
V-gan	[PTCP.PAST]	54
V-yotgan	[PTCP.PROG]	26
V-digan	[PTCP.NPST]	14
bor	[existence]	5
emas	[NEG]	4
V-moqchi	[ITT]	2
Adjective		1
V-(i)sh	[VN]	1
	Total	107

The target examples were extracted in three steps: 1. I entered *xsha* into the search window in Concordance, 2. The search extent was set to three words: *xsha*, and 3. I checked the examples not covered by this study and excluded them. As a result, I extracted 3,250 examples. This study deals with 107 examples of modal usage that do not have a lexical meaning and have one subject out of 3,250 examples. Table 1 shows all the items added to the dative -ga.

The past participle -gan displays the highest frequency (Table 1). I show each example of items added to the dative -ga below in order of frequency. The subordinate predicates in this example are written in bold.

V-gan [PTCP.PAST]:

(8) [Qorn-ingiz tosh kabi qattiq bo'l-ib qol-gan]-ga o'xsha-y=di.
stomach-2PL.POSS stone like hard be-CVB.SEQ remain-PTCP.PAST-DAT be.like-NPST=3
'Your stomach seems to become hard.' (ayol.uz)

V-votgan [PTCP.PROG]:

(9) Ammo [«Adolat» sotsial+demokratik partiya-si-ning gazeta-si bu haqda but Adolat social+democratic party-3.POSS-GEN newspaper-3.POSS this about

 chuqur-roq
 oʻyla-ma-yotgan]-ga
 oʻxsha-y=di.

 deep-COMP
 think-NEG-PTCP.PROG-DAT
 be.like-NPST=3

'However, the newspaper by the social democratic party "Adolat" does not seem to be considering this more deeply.' (uzbekistonovozi.uz)

V-digan [PTCP.NPST]:

(10) Lekin [Pamela hali+beri tugʻ-adigan]-ga oʻxsha-mas=di-ø.

but PN yet+since bear-PTCP.NPST-DAT be.like-PTCP.FUT=PAST-3

'However, Pamela does not seem to give birth.' (discovenger.uz)

bor [existence]:

(11) Bir qarash-da [ular-ning gap-i-da ham jon bor]-ga o'xsha-y=di.
one look-LOC 3PL-GEN talk-3.POSS-LOC also spirit existence-DAT be.like-NPST=3
'In a certain view, their talk seems to have spirit.' (uzvip.uz)

emas [NEG]:

(12) ..., nimaga=dir [sayt-ning blog-i ham mavjud emas]-ga oʻxsha-di-ø.

why=INF site-GEN blog-3.POSS also existent NEG-DAT be.like-PAST-3

'... the blog of (that) site does not seem to exist for some reason.' (blogger.uz)

V-mogchi [ITT]:

(13) ..., [azaliy raqib Falastin bilan hisob+kitob-ni toʻgʻrila-b ol-moqchi]-ga oʻxsha-y=di.

ancient rival Palestine with account+book-ACC correct-CVB.SEQ take-ITT-DAT be.like-NPST=3

'... (Israel) seems to intend to come to terms with (the relation of) Palestine who is an old rival.'

(uzhurriyat.uz)

Adjective:

(14) [Sunil Shetti-ga restoran-i-dan tush-adigan pul ham yetarli]-ga o'xsha-y=di.

PN-DAT restaurant-3.POSS-ABL fall-PTCP.NPST money also enough-DAT be.like-NPST=3

'Suniel Shetty seems to have enough money from his restaurant.' (namaste.uz)

V-(i)sh [VN]:

(15) Milliv chempionat-imiz bor-gan kim uv-da oʻvna-sa-ø sari championship-1PL.POSS go-PTCP.PAST national as who home-LOC play-COND-3 oʻsha jamoa tomon-i-da [ustunlik bo'l-ish-i]-ga o 'xsha-b qol-vap=ti. advantage that team direction-3.POSS-LOC be-VN-3.POSS-DAT be.like-CVB.SEQ remain-PROG=3 'As our national championship progresses, the advantage seems to be in playing at home.' (qashqadaryo.uz)

4. Discussion

First, I compare complement clauses with clauses that added the dative -ga in the modal usage of o'xsha-. I state each predicate in the order shown in Table 1 (participles, bor [existent], emas [NEG], V-moqchi [ITT], adjectives, and verbal nouns).

In the analysis, examples of three participles (past -gan, present -yotgan and non-past -digan) are attested. Hidaka (2020: 4) pointed out that the non-past participle -digan is not used as a predicate of compliment in these participles. The example in (16) a., formed by the non-past participle -digan, is not permitted; however, the example in b., formed by a verbal noun, is permitted.

(16) a. *A B-ga [C olma-ni ye-ydigan-ij-ni ayt-di-ø.

PN PN-DAT PN apple-ACC eat-PTCP.NPST-3.POSS-ACC say-PAST-3

b. A B-ga [C olma-ni yey-ish-i]-ni ayt-di-ø.

PN PN-DAT PN apple-ACC eat-VN-3.POSS-ACC say-PAST-3

'A told B that C ate an apple.' (Hidaka 2020: 4)

Thus, the clause with -digan in the modal usage of o 'xsha- is not subordinate.

As mentioned above, the clause with bor is not embedded without suffixes (see (7) in Section 2). Clauses with emas [NEG] (17), V-moqchi [ITT] (18), and adjectives (19) are also embedded without suffixes. I composed the examples in (17) and (19) myself and asked a native speaker (a female born in Tashkent in 1994) whether she would permit these examples. A predicate with only the dative in (a), a predicate with -lik + the dative -ga in (b), and a predicate followed by ekan in (c) were embedded. Only (a) was not permitted.

```
(17) a. *Sanjar [blog mavjud emas]-ga ishon-di-ø.

PN blog existent NEG-DAT believe-PAST-3
```

- b. Sanjar [blog mavjud emas-lig-i]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN blog existent NEG-CNMLZ-3.POSS-DAT believe-PAST-3
- c. Sanjar [blog mavjud emas ekan-i]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN blog existent NEG-DAT COP-3.POSS-DAT believe-PAST-3

 'Sanjar believed that the blog does not exist.'
- (18) a. *Sanjar [Alisher Tokyo-ga bor-moqchi]-ga ishon-di- θ . PN PN PLN-DAT go-ITT-DAT believe-PAST-3
 - b. Sanjar [Alisher Tokyo-ga bor-moqchi-lig-i]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN PN PLN-DAT go-ITT-CNMLZ-3.POSS-DAT believe-PAST-3
 - c. Sanjar [Alisher Tokyo-ga **bor-moqchi ekan-i**]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN PN PLN-DAT go-ITT COP-3.POSS-DAT believe-PAST-3

 'Sanjar believed that Alisher is going to go to Tokyo.'
- (19) a. *Sanjar [pul ham yetarli]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN money also enough-DAT be.like-PAST-3
 - b. Sanjar [pul ham yetarli-lig-i]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN money also enough-DAT be.like-PAST-3
 - c. Sanjar [pul ham **yetarli** ekan-i]-ga ishon-di-ø.

 PN money also enough COP-3.POSS-DAT be.like-PAST-3

 'Sanjar believed that money is also enough.'

A verbal noun is used as the predicate of the complement clause, as shown in (16) b.

As summarized above, I clarified that these two types of participles (past -gan and present -yotgan) and verbal nouns before the dative -ga are used as predicates of the complement clause (see (16)). If most clauses formed by the predicate before the dative -ga are not used without the suffix (ex. -lik) or the following items (ex. ekan), then the clauses in these predicates may not be subordinate.

In this study, I pointed out that the modal usage of o'xsha- is parallel to the structure formed by ekan 'seem.' Moreover, ekan is a modal word (the item expressing a speaker's attitude; see Section 1.2), while ekan can follow the items listed in Table 1, except for verbal nouns. In the same way as the modal usage of o'xsha-, the structure formed by ekan can have only one subject, and personal clitics are added to ekan. Each predicate is listed in the order shown in Table 1. The predicates before ekan in the following examples are in bold.

(20) V-gan [PTCP.PAST]

E'tibor qil-ma-gan ekan=man
attention do-NEG-PTCP.PAST EVID=1SG
'Apparently, I did not pay attention.' (Bodrogligeti 2003: 782)

(21) V-yotgan [PTCP.PROG]

 Qayd
 et-ish-i=cha,
 Pokiston-da
 havo
 desant-lar-i
 ora-si-da
 ayol-lar

 record
 do-VN-3.POSS=ADVLZ
 PLN-LOC
 air
 troop-PL-3.POSS
 between-3.POSS-LOC
 woman-PL

 son-i
 ort-ib
 bor-ayotgan
 ekan=ø.

 number-3.POSS
 increase-CVB.SEO
 go-PTCP.PROG
 EVID=3

'According to the record, the number of women seems to be increasing in Pakistan's airborne troops.'

(https://rost24.uz/oz/news/1131, viewed July 9, 2023)

(22) V-digan [PTCP.NPST]

```
Uh hu, bu ilon emas, ajdar boʻl-adigan ekan=ø. INTJ INTJ this snake NEG dragon be-PTCP.NPST EVID=3
```

'Uh hu, this seems to be a dragon, not a snake.' (https://n.ziyouz.com/portal-haqida/xarita/uzbek-nasri/g-ozi-rahmon-1947/g-ozi-rahmon-tilsimli-tog-lar-hikoya, viewed July 9, 2023)

(23) bor [existence]

```
Ona-si, to rtta uka-si bor ekan=ø. mother-3.POSS four younger.brother-3.POSS existence EVID=3
```

'His mother seems to have four children.' (https://n.ziyouz.com/portal-haqida/xarita/uzbek-nasri/shukur-xolmirzayev-1940-2005/shukur-xolmirzayev-yig-i-hikoya, viewed July 9, 2023)

(24) emas [NEG]

```
Bugun biz-ning kun-imiz emas ekan=ø.
today 1PL-GEN day-1PL.POSS NEG EVID=3
```

'Today does not seem to be our day' (https://championat.uz/oz/news/baxtiyor-ashurmatov-bugun-biznin g-kunimiz-emas-ekan?utm_medium%5B0%5D=champi%3Fid%3D122%3Fsort%3Dany%3Fid%3D5%3Fsort%3Dany, viewed July 9, 2023)

(25) V-mogchi [ITT]

```
    Ona-si
    bilan
    haj-ga
    bor-moqchi
    ekan=ø.

    mother-3.POSS
    with
    pilgrimage.to.Mecca-DAT
    go-ITT
    EVID=3
```

'He seems to go to the pilgrimage to Mecca with his mother.

(https://kun.uz/uz/00558806, viewed July 9, 2023)

(26) Adjective

```
Siz xursand ekan=siz
```

2PL pleased EVID=2PL

'You seem to be pleased.' (Bodrogligeti 2003: 778)

However, the future participle V-(a)r can be placed before ekan, as shown in (27).

(27) Ertaga dala-ga **chiq-ar** ekan=miz. tomorrow field-DAT go.out-PTCP.FUT EVID=1PL

'(Apparently,) tomorrow we will go out to the fields.' (Bodrogligeti 2003: 782)

In this corpus, there is no example in which the future participle V-(a)r can be placed before ekan in the modal use of o 'xsha-.

Table 2 summarizes a comparison between complement clauses and *ekan*. Firstly, I compared the second column, "This predicate can be placed before *o'xsha*- 'be like,' " to the first column, "This predicate can form the complement without adding any suffix or following another item." The types of predicates before *o'xsha*- are more numerous than those of the complement predicates. Subsequently, I compared the second column to the third column "The predicate can be placed *ekan*." The types of predicates before *o'xsha*- and *ekan* are the same, except for verbal nouns and future participles.

Table 2: The comparison of predicates in complement, before o'xsha- and before eka	Table 2: The	comparison of	predicates in co	omplement, before	re o 'xsha- and	before ekan
--	--------------	---------------	------------------	-------------------	-----------------	-------------

Predicate			This predicate can be placed before <i>o'xsha-'</i> be like.'	The predicate can be placed before <i>ekan</i> .
V-gan	[PTCP.PAST]	0	0	0
V-yotgan	[PTCP.PROG]	0	0	0
V-digan	[PTCP.NPST]	×	0	0
bor	[existence]	×	0	0
emas	[NEG]	×	0	0
V-moqchi	[ITT]	×	0	0
Adjectives	3	×	0	0
V-(i)sh	[VN]	0	0	×
V-(a)r/ V-mas	[PTCP.FUT] [PTCP.NEG.FUT]	×	No example from corpus	0

Thus, in the modal usage of o'xsha-, most of the predicates before o'xsha- are not used as predicates of a complement without adding a suffix or following another item, except a verbal noun. In other words, most examples of the modal usage of o'xsha- do not include subordinate clauses. Kononov (1960) named the modal usage of o'xsha- as "a special variation of the complex sentence," because most of this usage includes the clause not regarded as the subordinate, but also includes the clause regarded as the subordinate.

Finally, I discuss the differences in meaning between the modal usages of o'xsha- and ekan. I asked a native speaker (male, born in Tashkent in 1994) whether -ga o'xsha could be replaced with ekan, explaining the condition of this utterance in which the speaker touched the listener's forehead. He responded by stating that it could be replaced.

I also asked about the differences in the meaning of these sentences. He stated that the listener had low fever in (28) and high fever in (29). Thus, I consider the modal usage of o'xsha- to express low certainty, whereas ekan expresses high certainty.

5. Conclusion

I conducted the corpus examination in order to clarify the reason for Kononov's naming the modal usage of o'xsha-'be like' as "a special variation of the complex sentence." As a result, I clarified that the predicates placed before o'xsha-in examples from corpus are almost the same as the predicates placed before ekan. Thus, they do not almost include the subordinate. However, they also include a verbal noun which functions as the predicate of a subordinate clause. I examined Kononov's description of the modal usage of o'xsha-'a special variation of the complex sentence" because he considered that the predicates placed before o'xsha- have two aspects – including or not including a subordinate clause.

In addition, I clarified with certainty the differences between the modal usages of o 'xsha- and ekan, conducting the examination with a native speaker. The modal usages of o 'xsha- may express low certainty, whereas ekan may expresses high certainty. However, I need to carry out more examinations, focusing on the available adverbs.

List of abbreviations

-	suffix boundary	DAT	dative	PAST	past
=	clitic boundary	ENPH	emphatic	PL	plural
+	compound boundary	EVID	evidential	PLN	place name
1, 2, 3	first, second, third person	FUT	future	PN	person name
ABL	ablative	GEN	genitive	POSS	possessive
ACC	accusative	INF	indefinite	POT	potential
ADVLZ	adverbializer	INTJ	interjection	PROG	progressive
CNMLZ	clause nominalizer	ITT	intentional	PTCP	participle
COMP	comparative	LOC	locative	SEQ	sequential
COND	conditional	NEG	negative	SG	singular
COP	copula	NPST	non-past	VN	verbal noun
CVB	converb	PASS	nassive		

References

Bodrogligeti, András J. E. (2003) An academic grammar of modern literary Uzbek. München: Lincom Europa.

Kononov, Andrej N. (1960) *Grammatika sovremennogo uzbekskogo literaturnogo jazyka*. [Contemporary literary Uzbek grammar.] Moskva, Leningrad: Izdatel'stovo akademii nauk SSSR.

Hidaka, Shinsuke (2013) Uzbek (Data). Journal of the Institute of Language Research. 18: 467–85.

Hidaka, Shinsuke (2020) A study of subordinate clauses with participles and verbal nouns in Uzbek. Doctoral dissertation of Tokyo University of Foreign Studies.

Nakajima, Yoshiteru (2015) Concise Uzbek-Japanese dictionary. Osaka: Osaka University Press.

Radloff, Vasily V. (1893) Опыть словаря Тюркскихь Нартьчій. Томъ Первый. Гласные. = Versuch eines Wörterbuches der Türk-Dialecte. Erster Band Die Vocale. [Attempt of a dictionary of Turkic-Dialects. First Volume. Vowels.] Санктпетербург: Коммисіонеробъ императорской академіи наук.

Sugahara, Jun (2009) Concise modern Uyghur-Japanese dictionary. Tokyo: ILCAA.

Web corpus

Turkic Web – Uzbek. https://www.sketchengine.eu/uzwac-uzbek-corpus, accessed July 16th, 2023.

Acknowledgments

This study is a substantially revised version of a presentation made at the annual meeting of CSEL (Consortium for the Studies of Eurasian Languages) in 2023. I express my heartfelt gratitude to everyone who gave me informative advice there.

Two native Uzbek speakers assisted in this study. I express my heartfelt gratitude to them. However, all the errors in this study can be attributed to me.

This work was supported by the JSPS KAKENHI, grants #JP21H04346, #JP22J01538, and #JP22KJ1443.